

**MODEL-BASED VARIANCE OF MODIFIED MURTHY ESTIMATOR**

**Mariyam Hafeez and Muhammad Qaiser Shahbaz**

Department of Statistics  
G.C. University  
Lahore (PAKISTAN)

and

**Muhammad Hanif**

Lahore University of Management Sciences  
Lahore, Pakistan  
Email: hanif@lums.edu.pk

**ABSTRACT**

In this paper expected model-based variance of the modified Murthy (1957) estimator given by Shahbaz (2004) has been obtained by using the super population model. Empirical study has also been carried out to see the performance of the modified Murthy (1957) estimator under super-population model.

**KEY WORDS**

Unequal Probability Sampling, Model based variance.

**1. INTRODUCTION**

Horvitz and Thompson (1952) were the first who developed the theoretical ground and provide following estimator of population total:

$$y'_{HT} = \sum_{i \in S} \frac{y_i}{\pi_i} \tag{1.1}$$

The designed based variance is

$$Var(y'_{HT}) = \sum_{i=1}^N \frac{(1-\pi_i)}{\pi_i} Y_i^2 + \sum_{\substack{i=1, j=1 \\ j \neq i}}^N \frac{(\pi_{ij} - \pi_i \pi_j)}{\pi_i \pi_j} Y_i Y_j \tag{1.2}$$

Sen (1953) and, independently, Yates and Grundy (1953) obtained the following model based variance of the Horvitz–Thompson (1952) estimator:

$$\text{Var}\left(y'_{HT}\right) = \sum_{i=1}^N \sum_{\substack{j=1 \\ j>i}}^N \left(\pi_i \pi_j - \pi_{ij}\right) \left(\frac{Y_i}{\pi_i} - \frac{Y_j}{\pi_j}\right)^2 \quad (1.3)$$

Raj (1956) has given following ordered estimator of population total. For  $n=2$ :

$$t_{mean} = \frac{1}{2} \left[ \frac{y_i}{P_i} (1 + p_i) + \frac{y_j}{P_j} (1 - p_j) \right] \quad (1.4)$$

The variance of (1.4) is

$$\text{Var}(t_{mean}) = \frac{1}{8} \sum_{i=1}^N \sum_{\substack{j=1 \\ j \neq i}}^N P_i P_j (2 - P_i - P_j) \left(\frac{Y_i}{P_i} - \frac{Y_j}{P_j}\right)^2 \quad (1.5)$$

Murthy (1957) symmetrize the Raj (1956) estimator to obtain the following unbiased estimator of population total:

$$t_{symm} = \frac{1}{2 - p_i - p_j} \left[ \frac{y_i}{P_i} (1 - p_j) + \frac{y_j}{P_j} (1 - p_i) \right] \quad (1.6)$$

The variance of (1.5) is

$$\text{Var}(t_{symm}) = \frac{1}{2} \sum_{i=1}^N \sum_{\substack{j=1 \\ j \neq i}}^N \frac{P_i P_j (1 - P_i - P_j)}{2 - P_i - P_j} \cdot \left(\frac{Y_i}{P_i} - \frac{Y_j}{P_j}\right)^2 \quad (1.7)$$

Shahbaz (2004) obtained the following modified Murthy estimator by using the Durbin (1953) selection procedure in the general Murthy (1957) estimator:

$$t_{MM(D)} = \frac{1}{2} \left[ \frac{y_i}{P_i} + \frac{y_j}{P_j} \right] \quad (1.8)$$

The design based variance of (1.8) obtained by Shahbaz (2004) is:

$$\text{Var}(t_{MM(D)}) = \frac{1}{2} \sum_{i=1}^N \sum_{\substack{j=1 \\ j \neq i}}^N P_i P_j \left[ 1 - \frac{(1 - P_i - P_j)}{k(1 - 2P_i)(1 - 2P_j)} \right] \cdot \left\{ \frac{Y_i}{P_i} - \frac{Y_j}{P_j} \right\}^2 \quad (1.9)$$

Under the linear stochastic model:

$$\left. \begin{aligned}
 & y_i = \beta z_i + \varepsilon_i \\
 \text{with } & E(\varepsilon_i) = 0 \\
 & E(\varepsilon_i, \varepsilon_j) = \begin{cases} \sigma_i^2 & i = j \\ 0 & \text{otherwise} \end{cases} \\
 \text{where } & \sigma_i^2 = \sigma^2 z_i^{2\gamma} \quad \frac{1}{2} \leq \gamma \leq 1
 \end{aligned} \right\} \quad (1.10)$$

Bayless and Rao (1970) have shown that the expected variance of  $y'_{HT}$  is:

$$E_M \left[ \text{Var} \left( y'_{HT} \right) \right] = \sigma^2 \left( \frac{Z}{n} \right)^{2\gamma} \sum_{I=1}^N (1 - \pi_I) \pi_I^{2\gamma-1} \quad (1.11)$$

Rao and Bayless (1969) has obtained following model based variance of the Raj(1956) estimator under model

$$E_M \left[ \text{Var} \left( t_{mean} \right) \right] = \frac{\sigma^2}{4} \left( \frac{Z}{2} \right)^{2\gamma} \sum_{\substack{I=1 \\ J \neq I}}^N \sum_{J=1}^N \pi_I^{2\gamma-1} \pi_J (4 - \pi_I - \pi_J) \quad (1.12)$$

The expected variance of Murthy's variance under model obtained by Rao and Bayless (1969), is:

$$E_M \left[ \text{Var} \left( t_{symm} \right) \right] = \sigma^2 \left( \frac{Z}{2} \right)^{2\gamma} \sum_{\substack{I=1 \\ J \neq I}}^N \sum_{J=1}^N \pi_I^{2\gamma-1} \pi_J \left( \frac{2 - \pi_I - \pi_J}{4 - \pi_I - \pi_J} \right) \quad (1.13)$$

Rao and Bayless (1969) and Bayless and Rao (1970) have conducted extensive empirical study for the expected variances given above.

## 2. THE EXPECTED VARIANCE

In this section the expected variance of (1.9) under the model (1.10) has been obtained. For this write  $\pi_I = 2P_I$ , in equation (1.9):

$$\text{Var} \left( t_{MM(D)} \right) = \frac{1}{2} \sum_{\substack{I=1 \\ J \neq I}}^N \sum_{J=1}^N \pi_I \pi_J \left[ 1 - \frac{2 - \pi_I - \pi_J}{2k(1 - \pi_I)(1 - \pi_J)} \right] \left( \frac{Y_I}{\pi_I} - \frac{Y_J}{\pi_J} \right)^2 \quad (2.1)$$

Now the expected variance is:

$$E_M \left[ \text{Var} \left( t_{MM(D)} \right) \right] = E_M \left[ \frac{1}{2} \sum_{\substack{I=1 \\ J \neq I}}^N \sum_{J=1}^N \pi_I \pi_J \left\{ 1 - \frac{2 - \pi_I - \pi_J}{2k(1 - \pi_I)(1 - \pi_J)} \right\} \left( \frac{Y_I}{\pi_I} - \frac{Y_J}{\pi_J} \right)^2 \right]$$

Substituting the values of  $Y_I$  and  $Y_J$  from (1.10) we have:

$$E_M \left[ \text{Var} \left( t_{MM(D)} \right) \right] = E_M \left[ \frac{1}{2} \sum_{\substack{I=1, J=1 \\ J \neq I}}^N \pi_I \pi_J \left\{ 1 - \frac{2 - \pi_I - \pi_J}{2k(1 - \pi_I)(1 - \pi_J)} \right\} \left( \frac{\varepsilon_I}{\pi_I} - \frac{\varepsilon_J}{\pi_J} \right)^2 \right]$$

Opening the square and applying model expectation we have:

$$\begin{aligned} E_M \left[ \text{Var} \left( t_{MM(D)} \right) \right] &= \frac{1}{2} \sum_{\substack{I=1, J=1 \\ J \neq I}}^N \pi_I \pi_J \left\{ 1 - \frac{2 - \pi_I - \pi_J}{2k(1 - \pi_I)(1 - \pi_J)} \right\} \left( \frac{\sigma_I^2}{\pi_I^2} + \frac{\sigma_J^2}{\pi_J^2} \right) \\ &= \frac{\sigma^2}{2} \left( \frac{Z}{2} \right)^{2\gamma} \sum_{\substack{I=1, J=1 \\ J \neq I}}^N \pi_I \pi_J \left\{ 1 - \frac{2 - \pi_I - \pi_J}{2k(1 - \pi_I)(1 - \pi_J)} \right\} \left( \pi_I^{2\gamma-2} + \pi_J^{2\gamma-2} \right) \\ &= \sigma^2 \left( \frac{Z}{2} \right)^{2\gamma} \sum_{\substack{I=1, J=1 \\ J \neq I}}^N \pi_I^{2\gamma-1} \pi_J \left\{ 1 - \frac{2 - \pi_I - \pi_J}{2k(1 - \pi_I)(1 - \pi_J)} \right\} \\ &= \sigma^2 \left( \frac{Z}{2} \right)^{2\gamma} \left[ \sum_{I=1}^N \pi_I^{2\gamma-1} (2 - \pi_I) - \sum_{I=1}^N \pi_I^{2\gamma-1} \right] \\ E_M \left[ \text{Var} \left( t_{MM(D)} \right) \right] &= \sigma^2 \left( \frac{Z}{2} \right)^{2\gamma} \sum_{I=1}^N \pi_I^{2\gamma-1} (1 - \pi_I) \end{aligned} \quad (2.2)$$

Now comparing (2.2) with (1.11) we can see that the modified Murthy (1957) estimator given by Shahbaz (2004) has same model based variance as the model based variance of Horvitz and Thompson (1952) estimator under exact probability proportional to size selection procedures.

### 3. EMPIRICAL STUDY

In this section we have conducted the empirical study of the expected variances of various estimators. For this empirical study we have used ten populations. The expected variances given in section 2 have been calculated for value of the parameter  $\gamma$  ranging from 0.5 to 1.0. The expected variances have been given in Table-1. Looking at the expected variances given in Table-1 we can readily see that for all choices of the constant  $\gamma$ , the Murthy (1957) estimator outperform all other estimators involved in the study expect for  $\gamma = 1.0$  in which case the modified Murthy (1957) estimator given by Shahbaz (2004) outperform other estimators involved in the study. Further, we can see that the Raj (1956) estimator has worst performance for all the values of  $\gamma$  as this estimator has largest expected variance in all the populations.

**REFERENCES**

1. Bayless, D.L. and Rao, J.N.K. (1970). An empirical study of stabilities of estimators and variance estimators in unequal probability sampling for  $n = 3$  and  $4$ , *J. Amer. Stat. Assoc.* 65, 1645-1667.
2. Durbin, J. (1953). Some results in sampling when the units are selected with unequal probabilities, *J. Roy. Stat. Soc.*, B, 15, 262-269.
3. Horvitz, D.G. and Thompson, D.J. (1952). A generalization of sampling without replacement from a finite universe, *J. Amer. Stat. Assoc.* 47, 663-685.
4. Murthy, M.N. (1957). Ordered and unordered estimators in sampling without replacement, *Sankhya*, 18, 379-390.
5. Raj, D. (1956a). Some estimators in sampling with varying probabilities without replacement, *J. Amer. Stat. Assoc.* 60, 278-284.
6. Rao, J.N.K. and Bayless, D.L. (1969). An empirical study of the stabilities of estimators and variance estimators in unequal probability sampling of two units per stratum, *J. Amer. Stat. Assoc.*, 64, 540-549.
7. Sen, A.R. (1953). On the estimate of the variance in sampling with varying probabilities, *J. Ind. Soc. Agri. Stat.*, 5, 119-127.
8. Shahbaz, M.Q. (2004). A new estimator of population total using Durbin's selection procedure for unequal probability sampling. *Pak. J. Statist.* Vol. 20(2), 287-294.
9. Yates, F. and Grundy, P.M. (1953). Selection without replacement from within strata with probability proportional to size, *J. Roy. Stat. Soc.*, B, 15, 153-161.

**Table-1**

Pop	$\gamma = 0.5$				$\gamma = 0.6$			
	HT	Raj	Murthy	New	HT	Raj	Murthy	New
1.	10.00	22.00	9.40	10.00	11.26	25.39	10.77	11.26
2.	9.00	19.72	8.37	9.00	9.90	22.31	9.41	9.90
3.	15.00	31.40	14.41	15.00	16.43	34.88	15.94	16.43
4.	30.00	62.50	28.52	30.00	36.96	78.50	35.63	36.96
5.	50.00	103.14	49.11	50.00	64.93	134.71	64.06	64.93
6.	40.00	82.00	38.85	40.00	48.62	100.70	47.59	48.62
7.	90.00	181.80	88.55	90.00	113.38	230.25	112.03	113.38
8.	200.00	400.20	196.70	200.00	265.07	533.09	261.79	265.07
9.	220.00	439.50	215.87	220.00	295.39	593.52	291.22	295.39
10.	780.00	1552.83	770.66	780.00	1130.99	2259.48	1120.85	1130.99

**Table-1 (Continued)**

Pop	$\gamma = 0.7$				$\gamma = 0.8$			
	HT	Raj	Murthy	New	HT	Raj	Murthy	New
1.	12.80	29.63	12.48	12.80	14.71	34.93	14.62	14.71
2.	10.97	25.46	10.69	10.97	12.23	29.33	12.24	12.23
3.	18.17	39.12	17.82	18.17	20.28	44.30	20.11	20.28
4.	46.36	100.34	45.32	46.36	59.09	130.23	58.56	59.09
5.	84.82	176.97	84.06	84.82	111.43	233.82	110.93	111.43
6.	59.90	125.28	59.06	59.90	74.71	157.69	74.17	74.71
7.	144.58	295.04	143.42	144.58	186.35	381.98	185.53	186.35
8.	356.89	721.16	353.86	356.89	487.22	988.86	484.85	487.22
9.	403.90	815.99	400.00	403.90	561.20	1139.53	558.12	561.20
10.	1673.88	3354.83	1663.54	1673.88	2520.85	5067.09	2511.65	2520.85

**Table-1 (Continued)**

Pop	$\gamma = 0.9$				$\gamma = 1.0$			
	HT	Raj	Murthy	New	HT	Raj	Murthy	New
1.	17.07	41.60	17.30	17.07	20.00	50.00	20.67	20.00
2.	13.72	34.10	14.16	13.72	15.50	40.00	16.52	15.50
3.	22.86	50.64	22.90	22.86	26.00	58.40	26.33	26.00
4.	76.40	171.32	76.72	76.40	100.00	228.00	101.74	100.00
5.	147.20	310.62	147.20	147.20	195.50	414.80	196.35	195.50
6.	94.21	200.57	94.16	94.21	120.00	257.50	120.67	120.00
7.	242.44	499.01	242.18	242.44	318.00	657.00	318.63	318.00
8.	673.21	1371.97	672.25	673.21	940.00	1923.00	941.66	940.00
9.	790.69	1613.04	789.40	790.69	1127.50	2310.00	1129.68	1127.50
10.	3852.36	7763.90	3847.13	3852.36	5960.00	12040.00	5964.22	5960.00